Evidence-informed practice and evidence-based programs

Graeme Stuart, Jamin Day, Alan Hayes
Introductions: Name and Role
Increasing emphasis on evidence-based programs and practice

Communities for Children Facilitating Partners Evidence-based programme profiles

A-Z listing

Below are the profiles of evidence-based programmes that have a sufficient evidence base to be considered approved for use under the 50% requirement for Communities for Children Facilitating Partners.

Read more about the profiles, access a guide to selecting a programme, or access information about submitting an alternative programme.

1

1-2-3 Magic and Emotion Coaching

The 1-2-3 Magic and Emotion Coaching programme aims to help parents and carers manage difficult child behaviour with a focus on strategies and techniques that promote positive behaviour, encouragement in developing the child's ability to manage their emotional reactions, and relationship-building.

Delivered to: Parents
Evidence-informed practice: Which are you?
How do you feel about an increasing emphasis on evidence-informed practice?

Very concerned  

Very positive
How prepared are you for an increasing emphasis on evidence-informed practice?

Not at all prepared  

Very prepared
Evidence-based practice

A decision-making process that incorporates

Best research evidence
Best clinical experience
Consistent with family and client values

(Williams et al., 2015)
# Complex problems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Simple problem (e.g., following a recipe)</th>
<th>Complicated problems (e.g., sending a rocket to the moon)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The recipe is essential</td>
<td>Formulae are critical and necessary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recipes are tested to assure easy replication</td>
<td>Sending one rocket increases likelihood that the next will be OK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expertise is not required, but cooking experience increases success rate</td>
<td>High levels of expertise in a variety of fields are necessary for success</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recipes produce standardized products</td>
<td>Rockets are similar in critical ways</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The best recipes give good results every time</td>
<td>There is a high degree of certainty of outcome</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Complex problems

Complex problem (e.g., raising a child)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Formulae have a limited application</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Raising a child gives experience but doesn’t assure success with the next</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expertise helps but does not assure success</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Every child is unique and must be understood as an individual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uncertainty of outcome remains</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Moore, 2011)
Evidence-informed practice
A cyclical process

Define & redefine practice questions

Gather evidence

Critically appraise evidence

Practice decisions

Evaluate EBP process & client outcomes

Organisational processes to engage staff and move programs through phases

(Plath, 2017)
Action research

Observe

Act

Plan

Reflect
What is evidence?
Wheel of research evidence

- Correlation studies
- Qualitative studies
- Quasi-experiential
- RCTs

(Epstein, 2009)
Knowledge diamond

(Humphreys et al., 2011)
How do you know you are making a difference?
Results-Based Accountability

http://raguide.org/

Trying Hard Is Not Good Enough
How to Produce Measurable Improvements for Customers and Communities

Mark Friedman

http://raguide.org/
Results Accountability
is made up of two parts:

Population Accountability
about the well-being of
WHOLE POPULATIONS
For Communities – Cities – Counties – States - Nations

Performance Accountability
about the well-being of
CLIENT POPULATIONS
For Programs – Agencies – and Service Systems
Measures

Important to differentiate between:

1. Populations level measures – whole populations
   (For communities, towns, city, region etc.)

2. Performance level measures – the people we work with
   (For programs, services, organisations etc.)

(Friedman, 2005)
Quantity

How Much did we do?

Quality

How Well did we do it?

Results based accountability (http://raguide.org/)
Effort

How hard did we try?

Effect

Is anyone better off?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effort</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>Quality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How much</td>
<td>How much change did we do?</td>
<td>How well did we do it?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>did we</td>
<td>How much change did we produce?</td>
<td>What quality of change did we produce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>do?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effort</td>
<td>Quantity</td>
<td>Quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>How much did we do?</td>
<td>How well did we do it?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effect</td>
<td>Is anyone better off?</td>
<td>(How many?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(To what extent?)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Strengths-based measurement
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>0 = Not True (as far as you know)</th>
<th>1 = Somewhat or Sometimes True</th>
<th>2 = Very True or Often True</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  1. Acts too young for his/her age</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>32. Feels he/she has to be perfect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  2. Drinks alcohol without parents’ approval (describe):________________________</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>33. Feels or complains that no one loves him/her</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  3. Argues a lot</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>34. Feels others are out to get him/her</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  4. Fails to finish things he/she starts</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>35. Feels worthless or inferior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  5. There is very little he/she enjoys</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>36. Gets hurt a lot, accident-prone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  6. Bowel movements outside toilet</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>37. Gets in many fights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  7. Bragging, boasting</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>38. Gets teased a lot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  8. Can’t concentrate, can’t pay attention for long</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>39. Hangs around with others who get in trouble</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  9. Can’t get his/her mind off certain thoughts; obsessions (describe):________________________</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>40. Hears sound or voices that aren’t there (describe):________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  10. Can’t sit still, restless, or hyperactive</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>41. Impulsive or acts without thinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  11. Clings to adults or too dependent</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>42. Would rather be alone than with others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  12. Complains of loneliness</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>43. Lying or cheating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  13. Confused or seems to be in a fog</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>44. Bites fingernails</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  14. Cries a lot</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>45. Nervous, highstrung, or tense</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  15. Cruel to animals</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>46. Nervous movements or twitching (describe):________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  16. Cruelty, bullying, or meanness to others</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>47. Nightmares</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  17. Daydreams or gets lost in his/her thoughts</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>48. Not liked by other kids</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  18. Deliberately harms self or attempts suicide</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>49. Constipated, doesn’t move bowels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  19. Demands a lot of attention</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>50. Too fearful or anxious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  20. Destroys his/her own things</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>51. Feels dizzy or lightheaded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  21. Destroys things belonging to his/her family or others</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>52. Feels too guilty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  22. Disobedient at home</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>53. Overeating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  23. Disobedient at school</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>54. Overtired without good reason</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 1 2  24. Doesn’t eat well</td>
<td>0 1 2</td>
<td>55. Overweight</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From a survey for high school students

66. During your life, how many times have you used any form of cocaine, including powder, crack, or freebase?

- **A** 0 times
- **B** 1 or 2 times
- **C** 3 to 9 times
- **D** 10 to 19 times
- **E** 20 to 39 times
- **F** 40 or more times

Franklin County/North Quabbin Youth Health Survey
During your life, how many times have you used:

- Heroin (also called smack, junk, or China White)?
- Methamphetamines (also called speed, crystal, crank, or ice)?
- Ecstasy (also called MDMA)?
- Synthetic marijuana (also called K2, Spice, fake weed, King Kong, Yucatan Fire, Skunk, or Moon Rocks)?
71. During the past 30 days, how many times did you sniff glue, breathe the contents of aerosol spray cans, or inhale any paints or sprays to get high?

- A 0 times
- B 1 or 2 times
- C 3 to 9 times
- D 10 to 19 times
- E 20 to 39 times
- F 40 or more times
During the past 30 days, how many times did you

• Use prescription stimulants or amphetamines without a doctor telling you to take them?

• Use prescription sedatives without a doctor telling you to take them?

• Use prescription tranquilizers without a doctor telling you to take them?

• Use narcotic prescription drugs without a doctor telling you to take them?
21. During the past 30 days, on how many days did you carry a gun?
- 0 days
- 1 day
- 2 or 3 days
- 4 or 5 days
- 6 or more days

22. During the past 30 days, on how many days did you carry a weapon such as a gun, knife, or club on school property?
- 0 days
- 1 day
- 2 or 3 days
- 4 or 5 days
- 6 or more days

23. During the past 30 days, on how many days did you not go to school because you felt you would be unsafe at school or on your way to or from school?
- 0 days
- 1 day
- 2 or 3 days
- 4 or 5 days
- 6 or more days

26. During the past 12 months, how many times were you in a physical fight on school property?
- 0 times
- 1 time
- 2 or 3 times
- 4 or 5 times
- 6 or 7 times
- 8 or 9 times
- 10 or 11 times
- 12 or more times

27. During the past 12 months, have you ever been a member of a gang?
- Yes
- No

28. Has anyone ever had sexual contact with you against your will?
- Yes
- No

29. Have you ever been physically forced to have sexual intercourse when you did not want to?
- Yes
- No
What messages do these questions give to youth filling in the survey?
26. Think of your **four best friends** (the friends you feel closest to). In the past year (12 months), how many of your best friends have:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Options</th>
<th>4 of my friends</th>
<th>3 of my friends</th>
<th>2 of my friends</th>
<th>1 of my friends</th>
<th>None of my friends</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. <strong>participated in clubs, organizations or activities at school?</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. <strong>smoked cigarettes?</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. <strong>tried beer, wine or hard liquor</strong> (for example, vodka, whiskey or gin) when their parents didn't know about it?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
continued

• Made a commitment to stay drug-free?
• Used marijuana?
• Tried to do well in school?
• Used LSD, cocaine, amphetamines, or other illegal drugs?
• Been suspended from school?
• Liked school?
28. How wrong do you think it is for someone your age to:

- take a handgun to school?  
- steal something worth more than $5?
- pick a fight with someone?
- attack someone with the idea of seriously hurting them?
- stay away from school all day when their parents think they are at school?
continued

• Have one or two drinks of an alcoholic beverage nearly everyday?

• Drink beer, wine or hard liquor (for example, vodka, whiskey or gin) regularly, that is, at least once or twice a month?

• Smoke cigarettes?

• Smoke marijuana?

• Use LSD, cocaine, amphetamines or another illegal drug?
Do these questions give a different message to youth filling in the survey?
What is our priority?
Parent Empowerment and Efficacy Measure (PEEM)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rate how well each statement describes the way you feel right now</th>
<th>Your rating out of 10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☹ 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 ☻</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This sounds nothing like me</td>
<td>This sounds exactly like me</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Practice Question:** *I get time for myself*

1. I find it easy to talk to people like teachers, doctors and nurses about my children
2. I know how to get useful information about how my children’s needs change as they grow
3. I feel good when I think about the future for my children
4. I can work out what to do if any of my children have a problem
5. We have clear rules and routines in my family
6. I can find services for my children when I need to
7. In my family there is more to enjoy than to worry about
8. I stay calm and manage life even when it’s stressful
9. I believe my children will do well at school
10. I can help make this community a better place for children

Case studies

WE ARE VERY VALUABLE PARTNERS IN POLICY MAKING.

We are worth listening to!
Possible questions for case studies

1. What measures are used or could be used?
2. Which of the RBA questions do they answer?
   • How much did we do?
   • How well did we do it?
   • What difference did we make?
3. What would the experience of families be like in having this data collected? (e.g., Is it strengths-based? How personal is it?)
4. How is it fed back to families?
5. How is incorporated into practice?
Evidence-based programs
Practice vs Programs

• Evidence-based practices are built on theory and research but are not a complete, systematised program of intervention

• Evidence-based programs are standardised, systematised and rigorously evaluated
Program fidelity

Important to balance

• Fidelity - Staying true to the original program design
• Adaptation – Ensuring the program is appropriate for the context
Risky or unacceptable adaptations

- Reducing the number or length of sessions or how long participants are involved
- Lowering the level of participant engagement
- Eliminating key messages or skills learned
- Removing topics
- Changing the theoretical approach
- Using staff or volunteers who are not adequately trained or qualified
- Using fewer staff members than recommended.

(O'Connor, Small, & Cooney, 2007)
Acceptable adaptations

• Changing language – translating and/or modifying vocabulary
• Replacing images to show children and families that look like the target audience
• Replacing cultural references
• Modifying some aspects of activities such as physical contact
• Adding relevant, evidence-based content to make the program more appealing to participants
Be selective
Efficacy versus effectiveness

- Efficacy involves demonstrating that the program can work under controlled (often ideal) conditions
- Effectiveness involves demonstrating that it works under the conditions typically encountered “in the field”
Selecting programs

• Evidence-based programs may not be effective in some contexts
• Not all effective initiatives have an evidence-base or are on lists of evidence-based programs
• Wise to measure the impact of the programs we run
Some positives of a focus on evidence-informed practice

• We want to be as effective as we can
• **Evidence from a range of sources** can help us achieve better results
• We need to be sure that families and communities are **better off** because of our work
• **Critical reflection** leads to better practice and innovation
References


Graeme Stuart
graeme.stuart@newcastle.edu.au
Blog:
sustainingcommunity.wordpress.com